



STATE OF WASHINGTON
OFFICE OF THE STATE HUMAN RESOURCES DIRECTOR

DIRECTOR'S REVIEW PROGRAM
521 Capitol Way South, P.O. Box 40911, Olympia, WA 98504-0911
(360) 664-0388 · FAX (360) 586-4694

July 18, 2012

TO: Tracy Peterson, Staff Representative
Washington Public Employees Association (WPEA)

FROM: Teresa Parsons, SPHR
Director's Review Program Supervisor

SUBJECT: Cassandra Duncan v. Wenatchee Valley College (WVC)
Allocation Review Request ALLO-11-110

On May 1, 2012, I conducted a Director's review telephone conference regarding the allocation of Cassandra Duncan's position. In addition to you and Ms. Duncan, Reagan Bellamy, Executive Director of Human Resources, participated in the conference on behalf of WVC. After the Director's review conference, I requested additional information, which I received via email on May 25 and 29, 2012.

Director's Determination

This position review was based on the work performed for the six-month period prior to August 18, 2011, the date WVC's Human Resources (HR) Office received Ms. Duncan's request for a position review. As the Director's designee, I carefully considered all of the documentation in the file, the exhibits presented during the Director's review conference, and the verbal comments provided by both parties. Based on my review and analysis of Ms. Duncan's assigned duties and responsibilities, I conclude her position is properly allocated to the Fiscal Technician Lead classification.

Background

Ms. Duncan works in the Cashier's Office within Fiscal Services and reports directly to the Director of Fiscal Services (Exhibit B-3). Ms. Duncan completed a Position Review Request (PRR) form asking that her Fiscal Technician Lead position be reallocated to the Fiscal Technician Supervisor classification. She and her supervisor at the time, Fiscal Services Director Jonah Nicholas, signed the PRR on July 8, 2011, which WVC's HR Office received on August 18, 2011. Ms. Duncan oversees the staff working in the Cashier's Office, which include one full-time, permanent position and two work study students. Although the PRR describes the full-time position as a Fiscal Technician 1, Ms. Duncan clarified the position at the time relevant to this review was a Cashier 1, also identified on the organizational chart (Exhibit B-3). Ms. Duncan's former supervisor, Mr. Nicholas, left the Director of Fiscal Services position shortly after signing Ms. Duncan's PRR, and there was a period of time when the Director of Fiscal

Services position was vacant. Subsequent to Ms. Duncan submitting her request for reallocation, Gerald Tomek became the Director of Fiscal Services.

After receiving the PRR, Ms. Bellamy met with Ms. Duncan on September 23, 2011, to discuss her position's duties (Exhibit B-4). On October 12, 2011, Ms. Bellamy determined Ms. Duncan's position was appropriately allocated to the Fiscal Technician Lead classification. On November 10, 2011, Ms. Duncan requested a Director's review of WVC's allocation decision.

Summary of Ms. Duncan's Perspective

Ms. Duncan asserts her position serves in a supervisory role to one full-time, permanent position (Cashier 1) and two part-time work study positions in the Cashier's Office. Ms. Duncan states that her position is in a separate area from the rest of Fiscal Services and that she supervises the daily operations of the Cashier's Office, including planning and scheduling the work assigned to staff. She further states that staff come to her first with questions relating to the cashier counter. Ms. Duncan contends she assisted her supervisor in selecting, interviewing and hiring for the Cashier 1 position and though he had final signature authority, she contends she made the hiring decision. Further, Ms. Duncan contends her supervisor has delegated her position the authority to approve leave for the Cashier 1 and full authority to hire, schedule, evaluate, and let go, if necessary, all work study students. She indicates that she also tracks and provides input on the Cashier 1's performance. Ms. Duncan notes that she signs work study contracts as the supervisor, and she points out that her supervisor at the time of this review supported her reallocation to the Fiscal Technician Supervisor class.

Summary of WVC's Reasoning

WVC recognizes the importance of Ms. Duncan's position to the Cashier Office and agrees her position assists the Director of Fiscal Services in hiring, reviewing work, and providing feedback on performance. However, WVC contends ultimate signature authority remains with the Director, who is Ms. Duncan's supervisor. WVC asserts the Director is also the supervisor of record for the full-time Cashier 1 position. In addition, WVC asserts Ms. Duncan's current classification of Fiscal Technician Lead allows for supervision of lower level staff. WVC contends the majority of Ms. Duncan's duties and responsibilities fit within the Fiscal Technician Lead classification.

Rationale for Director's Determination

The purpose of a position review is to determine which classification best describes the overall duties and responsibilities of a position. A position review is neither a measurement of the volume of work performed, nor an evaluation of the expertise with which that work is performed. A position review is a comparison of the duties and responsibilities of a particular position to the available classification specifications. This review results in a determination of the class that best describes the overall duties and responsibilities of the position. Liddle-Stamper v. Washington State University, PAB Case No. 3722-A2 (1994).

Duties and Responsibilities

On the Position Review Request (PRR), Ms. Duncan describes her position's purpose as follows (Exhibits A-2 and B-1):

To maintain records and accounts for students including sponsorships and refunds. Process financial aid requests and corrections given by Kevin Berg, Laura Murphy and Angie Jaquish [Financial Aid and Scholarships]. Assign and oversee duties to the Fiscal Tech 1 [Cashier 1] and work study students. Find and correct mistakes made within the office.

The following summarizes the primary job duties described on the PRR:

- 25% Processing financial aid requests and corrections . . . including outside scholarship input and vet benefit processing. [This involves balancing accounts with the Financial Aid Office].
- 25% Processing, signing and reviewing all sponsorship contracts and data, including construction of new contracts when necessary. Continual interaction with sponsored students and their counselors.
- 15% Assist in hiring of Fiscal Tech 1 [Cashier 1], full hiring/letting go of work study students. Supervising of employee time, delegating work, and training [Cashier 1] and work study students. Working with Omak cashiers [Omak campus] and registration to oversee their student accounts and make corrections. Keeping track and signing of work study time sheets.
- 10% Input accounting for outside payments into BM1620 [account screen]. Utilizing and running data x reports, then reviewing and then processing into SMS [student system] and FMS [accounting system]. Deciphering and correcting incorrect student tuition and fee charges.
- 10% Adding of tuition holds, collections processing, and refunds.
- 5% Cashiering duties including the deposits from student clubs, sports, parking and the library. Covering the counter for breaks and lunches.
- 5% Dorm payments, deposits, refunds, key replacement and application fees.
- 5% Processing, refunding, invoicing and correcting of Continuing Education transactions.

On the PRR, her supervisor has indicated that Ms. Duncan oversees the cashiering department with minimal supervision (Exhibit A-3). He further indicated Ms. Duncan has the authority to make decisions around work prioritization, leave approval for the Cashier 1 prior to reaching his desk, sponsorship input, job scheduling, fee code table updating, refund table updating, invoicing outside agencies, and hiring work study students. During the Director's review conference, Ms. Duncan acknowledged her supervisor retained signature authority but emphasized that he relied on her to make the actual decisions regarding staff in the Cashier's Office. Ms. Duncan's supervisor supported her reclassification to the Fiscal Technician Supervisor class.

Class Specifications

When comparing the assignment of work and level of responsibility to the available class specifications, the class series concept (if one exists) followed by definition and distinguishing characteristics are primary considerations. While examples of typical work identified in a class specification do not form the basis for an allocation, they lend support to the work envisioned within a classification.

The **Fiscal Technician Class Series Concepts** states, in part:

Positions perform ongoing, routine and repetitive fiscal tasks in a manual or automated system. Duties can be assigned in Accounts Receivables, Accounts Payable, Purchasing, Payroll, Grants and Contracts, Student Aid, Fixed Assets, Revenue, or General Accounting.

Positions prepare, review, verify, and process fiscal, accounting, budget, book or record keeping documents. Performs computing, calculating financial, statistical and numerical data to maintain accounting, budgeting, purchasing, payroll records and reports. Records details of fiscal or business transactions in an increasing automated fiscal computer enhanced environment.

Ms. Duncan's position fits within the class series concept for Fiscal Technician positions.

The **Fiscal Technician Supervisor** definition reads as follows:

Supervise technical/clerical support staff in assigned fiscal activities including planning, coordinating and determining of methods and procedures to be utilized in the maintenance of controls, records and reports.

The distinguishing characteristics include the following:

With delegated authority, interview and recommend selection of applicants, conduct training, assign and schedule work, act upon leave requests, conduct annual performance evaluations and recommend disciplinary action. Supervise technical/clerical support staff in accounting, budgeting, cashing, payroll, and purchasing. This class is distinguished from the Accounting Supervisor by the absence of a requirement to perform complex accounting/fiscal duties normally required of a professional accountant.

Further, the Office of the State Human Resources Director (OSHRD) Glossary of Classification Terms defines **supervisor** as follows:

<http://hr.wa.gov/CompClass/CompAndClassServices/Pages/HRProfessionalTools.aspx>

An employee who is assigned responsibility by management to participate in all of the following functions with respect to their subordinate employees:

- Selecting staff
- Training and development
- Planning and assignment of work
- Evaluating performance

- Resolving grievances
- Taking corrective action

Participation in these functions is not routine and requires the exercise of individual judgment.

The Fiscal Technician Supervisor typical work examples include the following:

- Interpret fiscal policy; coordinate fiscal operations with data processing personnel as required; review and verify work of Fiscal Technicians for procedural compliance and accuracy; investigate discrepancies; correct errors;
- Coordinate computer input processed either by batch control or on-line computer terminals . . .
- Maintain records, authorize changes; compile periodic reports for special funds or grants, student aid programs, payroll, purchases, accounts payable and accounts receivable, cashiering, or other specialized fiscal activities; assist in preparation of periodic fiscal reports, report and record reconciliations and statements;
- Perform the duties of Fiscal Technicians;
- Supervise staff in a specialized unit such as payroll, cashiering or collection of outstanding accounts as part of the total fiscal unit or operation.

Ms. Duncan assists with hiring, training, prioritizing and scheduling work in the Cashier's Office. She also provides input on staff performance, makes recommendations, and approves leave. Some of the functions Ms. Duncan performs reach aspects of supervision. However, when comparing the overall level of supervisory responsibility assigned to Ms. Duncan's position, it does not encompass the full scope of responsibility in areas such as performance evaluations or disciplinary actions. Ms. Duncan's supervisor, the Director of Fiscal Services, has retained supervisory authority for the full-time Cashier 1 position, though he does receive input from Ms. Duncan. Besides the Cashier 1, Ms. Duncan also oversees the work of two work study students, whose combined hours from March-September 2011 total 720.5 hours (Exhibit D-1-c).

Historically, the former Higher Education Personnel Board (HEPB) relied on three components for determining whether a position tasked with supervising student workers met the same standard as a position supervising classified staff. The three components included the definition of supervisor, the intent of the related class specification, and whether the collective hours of student supervision equated to one FTE. Udovich, Arrington, and Pittman v. The Evergreen State College. HEPB Nos. 3607, 3608, and 3609 (1992).

The PRB has also addressed the one FTE standard applied by previous Boards. The PRB agreed "there must be a threshold which can be objectively applied to each set of duties and responsibilities when determining the appropriateness of allocation to a lead or supervisory class." The PRB further concurred "the established threshold of 1.0 FTE should continue to be used as the basis for determining the appropriateness of allocation to a lead or supervisory class." Tacoma Community College v. Edward Harmon, PRB Case No. R-ALLO-08-012 (2008), citing Halcomb v. Shoreline Community College, Higher Education Personnel Board (HEPB) Case No. 3453 (1992);

Baker v. University of Washington Health Services, Personnel Appeals Board (PAB), Case No. 3821-A3 (1994); and Washington State University v. Marc Anderson, PAB Case No. ALLO-04-005 (2004).

You provided time records for the two work study students from March–September 2011, which include the review period of Ms. Duncan's position. The total number of full-time hours available to work during that period (minus holidays) was 1216. However, the combined work study hours totaled 720.5. As a result, the work study students alone do not form the equivalent of one FTE. Further, the Director of Fiscal Services is considered the supervisor of record for the full-time Cashier 1 (Exhibits A-2, page 3 and D-4). In addition, while there is an element of evaluation and corrective action Ms. Duncan employs when providing feedback and recommendations to the Director of Fiscal Services, her level of involvement is more in line with a lead position. Although an evaluation may be performed in a format that differs from the Performance Development Plan (PDP) process, the evaluation involves a more in-depth assessment than assigning, training, checking the work of employees, and providing verbal feedback. Overall, the duties and responsibilities assigned to Ms. Duncan's position do not fully reach the definition of supervisor for the period under review.

The **Fiscal Technician Lead** definition reads as follows:

This is the senior, specialist, or leadworker level of the series. Positions often perform complex technical fiscal duties in a wide variety of settings. Interpret and apply fiscal regulations and procedures. Ensure procedural fiscal compliance, accuracy, and deadlines are met. Establish and maintain comprehensive fiscal, book, or record keeping systems, analyzing and maintaining fiscal accounts or records. Positions at this level often support other diverse units in the organization. Positions may also specialize in one fiscal area such as overseeing the total payroll function. Other positions may be designated to function as the leadworker over other positions performing fiscal support related activities.

There are no specific distinguishing characteristics identified for Fiscal Technician Lead class. However, the OSHRD Glossary of Classification Terms defines **lead** position as "[a]n employee who performs the same or similar duties as other employees in his/her work group and has the designated responsibility to regularly assign, instruct, and check the work of those employees on an ongoing basis."

Some of the Fiscal Technician Lead typical work examples include the following:

- Develops, modifies, and maintains multiple record keeping and reporting systems for varied and complex sources of funding; develops procedures for implementation, execution, control, and review/audit of fiscal operations;
- Develops budgets for grants, contracts, or other funding requests; prepares appropriate forms for contracts and agreements . . .
- Coordinates payroll policies and procedures . . .
- Audits involved . . . reports and make complex accounting adjustments; performs reconciliations of bank accounts in depositories;

- Recommends approval and setup accounting entries on compromise settlements, cancellations of penalties, and deferred payment contracts;
- Reviews and analyzes out of balance accounts, making necessary adjustments where applicable;
- As a leadworker, trains lower level staff, assigns and reviews work, and participates in the evaluation of work and performance;
- Senior or specialist positions may lead or supervise lower level staff. However, leadworker position must lead lower level staff.

Overall, Ms. Duncan's duties are consistent with these statements. Her primary responsibilities involve processing financial aid and sponsorship contracts while overseeing the college's cashiering functions to include hiring and training work study students; regularly scheduling and assigning work to the Cashier 1 and work study students; providing instructions to cashiering staff and input on employee performance; and general oversight of time records and leave approval.

It is clear Ms. Duncan's position is highly valued and an asset to the college. A position's allocation does not diminish the quality of work performed and is not a reflection of performance. Rather, an allocation is based on the majority of work assigned to a position and how that work best aligns with the available job classes. At the time relevant to this review, the overall duties and level of responsibility assigned to Ms. Duncan's position best fit the Fiscal Technician Lead classification.

Appeal Rights

RCW 41.06.170 governs the right to appeal. RCW 41.06.170(4) provides, in relevant part, the following:

An employee incumbent in a position at the time of its allocation or reallocation, or the agency utilizing the position, may appeal the allocation or reallocation to . . . the Washington personnel resources board Notice of such appeal must be filed in writing within thirty days of the action from which appeal is taken.

The mailing address for the Personnel Resources Board (PRB) is P.O. Box 40911, Olympia, Washington, 98504-0911. The PRB Office is located at 521 Capitol Way South, Olympia, Washington. The main telephone number is (360) 664-0388, and the fax number is (360) 586-4694.

If no further action is taken, the Director's determination becomes final.

c: Cassandra Duncan
Reagan Bellamy, WVC
Lisa Skriletz, OSHRD

Enclosure: List of Exhibits

CASSANDRA DUNCAN v. WVC
ALLO-11-110

A. Cassandra Duncan's Exhibits

1. November 10, 2011 Director's Review Request letter from Tracy Peterson, WPEA
2. Position Review Request Form signed July 2011
3. Employee Development and Performance Plan from 03/2012 to 03/2011 and Performance Expectations (unsigned)
4. October 12, 2011 WVC allocation determination

B. WVC's Exhibits

1. Position Review Request Form, date stamped August 18, 2011 (same as A-2)
2. Position Review Request Supervisory Section, signed July 8, 2011
3. Organizational Chart
4. September 23, 2011 Desk Audit Notes

C. Class Specifications

1. Cashier 1 (149E)
2. Cashier 2 (149F)
3. Cashier 3 (149G)
4. Fiscal Technician Lead (148O)
5. Fiscal Technician Supervisor (148P)

D. Additional Exhibits requested by Director's Designee

1. May 25, 2012 emails from Tracy Peterson, WPEA to Teresa Parsons and Reagan Bellamy, WVC, with the following attachments:
 - a. On-Campus Cashier 1 Job Description (Work study)
 - b. Student Employment Authorization Forms
 - c. WVC Student Timesheets (pages 1–10)
2. May 29, 2012 email from Reagan Bellamy, WVC, with comment about Fiscal Tech Lead classification allowing for supervision of lower level staff
3. May 29, 2012 email from Cassandra Duncan commenting on lead/supervision in response to Reagan Bellamy's comment in Exhibit D-2.
4. May 29, 2012 email from Reagan Bellamy, WVC, stating the Director of Fiscal Services is the supervisor of record for the Cashier 1 position.